

Ms. Jane Horvath
Senior Director of Global Privacy, Apple
Email: jane_horvath@apple.com

March 11, 2022

Dear Ms. Horvath,

The Citizen Lab, an interdisciplinary laboratory based at the Munk School of Global Affairs & Public Policy, University of Toronto, is currently researching censorship in Apple product engravings across different regions. We summarize our findings as follows:

- Six months after our [original study](#), we reanalyze Apple's engraving filtering across six different world regions.
- Since our initial report, we find that Apple has eliminated their Chinese political censorship in Taiwan. However, Apple continues to perform broad, keyword-based political censorship in Hong Kong, despite human rights groups' recommendations for American companies to resist blocking content.

We would appreciate a response from Apple to the following questions by March 18, 2022:

1. Which laws, regulations, or policies (internal to Apple or external to Apple) govern or apply to the use of keywords to filter engravings in Hong Kong?
2. Do there exist public facing documents published by Apple that explain how Apple applies keyword filtering to engravings in Hong Kong? If so, where? If not, why not?
3. Has Apple received directives on what keywords to filter from mainland Chinese or Hong Kong government agencies or individuals? If so, from which agencies and individuals, and how often? Were they followed and why?
4. Was Apple's list of keywords used to filter engravings for Hong Kong users determined entirely proactively by Apple, or have some filtered keywords been informed by law enforcement requests?

munkschool.utoronto.ca



At Trinity College
1 Devonshire Place
Toronto, ON
Canada M5S 3K7
T: 416.946.8900 F: 416.946.8915

At the Observatory
315 Bloor Street West
Toronto, ON
Canada M5S 0A7
T: 416.946.8929 F: 416.946.8877

At the Canadiana Gallery
14 Queen's Park Crescent West
Toronto, ON
Canada M5S 3K9
T: 416.978.5120 F: 416.978.5079

5. Does Apple view Hong Kong's 2020 National Security Law as obligating proactive filtering of engravings for Hong Kong users? Does Apple believe there is any legal obligation to proactively filter engravings for Hong Kong users?
6. Why did Apple decide to censor the following keywords for engravings in Hong Kong: “信仰自由” (freedom of religion), “新聞自由” (freedom of the press), “真普選” (true universal suffrage), “宗教” (religion), and “上訪” (petition)?

We plan to publish a report reflecting our research. Provided we receive your response by March 18, 2022, we will publish your response in full alongside our research report.

Sincerely,



Professor Ronald J. Deibert, OOnt
Professor of Political Science, University of Toronto
Director, the Citizen Lab at the Munk School of Global Affairs & Public Policy, University of Toronto